

REPORT TITLE: ORILLIA PUPIL ACCOMMODATION REVIEW – RECOMMENDATIONS
REPORT NUMBER: 8. 2) 18-2009
DESTINATION: Board Meeting #18
DATE: Wednesday, November 25, 2009
AUTHOR OF REPORT: Michael O’Keefe, Director of Education
TYPE OF REPORT: ACTION

PUPIL ACCOMMODATION REVIEW AREA: **Foley Catholic School (FOL)**
Guardian Angels Catholic School (GAN)
Monsignor Lee Catholic School (MLE)
Notre Dame Catholic School (NOD)
St. Bernard’s Catholic School (SBE)

Background:

1. Staff reported to the Board on October 14 of this year with respect to the Orillia Pupil Accommodation Review in response to public input received at the October 5, 2009 Meeting.
2. The requirements of the Pupil Accommodation Review (PAR) process now require the Board to consider the decisions related to the accommodation solutions.
3. This report provides updated information since Staff’s report in October, including the comments received from the Update Meeting of the Orillia Pupil Accommodation Committee on November 17, 2009.
4. The following reports are referenced as background and supporting information to this report:
 - May 20, 2009 Report of the Orillia PAC to the Director of Education (Appendix 1)
 - June 24, 2009 Report to Board in Response to the Orillia PAC Report (Appendix 2)
 - October 14, 2009 Report to Board in Response to October 5, 2009 Public Meeting (Appendix 3)
 - November 9, 2009 Report of Alternative Sites by Planning Consultant (Appendix 4)
 - November 17, 2009 Update to Orillia PAC Presentation (Appendix 5)
 - Summary of the Schedule of Meetings of the Orillia PAC and the Public Meetings (Appendix 6)

Comments:

5. The Orillia PAC made the following recommendations with respect to accommodation options for the elementary schools serving the Orillia Area:

Foley (FOL) should remain status quo for the school building. Consideration should be given to proceed with a review of the school’s boundary to better balance enrolment and capacity.

Notre Dame (NOD) should also remain status quo for the school building. Consideration should be given to proceed with a review of the school's boundary to better balance enrolment and capacity. In addition, consideration should be given to review timing of site acquisition for the future elementary site in West Ridge to meet the growth requirements.

St. Bernard's (SBE) should be replaced with a new school on the existing site. The replacement school should be designed for approximately 300 – 350 pupil places. Consideration should be given to proceed with a review of the school's boundary to better balance enrolment and capacity.

Monsignor Lee (MLE) & Guardian Angels (GAN) should be consolidated in a replacement school either on an alternative site within 1.6 km of the existing two (2) schools (Option A), or on the existing Monsignor Lee school site (Option B) (Partial replacement only, existing MLE gymnasium and office to be retained). Consideration should be given to proceed with a review of the schools' boundaries to better balance enrolment and capacity.

6. In June of this year, our Board received a funding announcement from the Ministry of Education that included a capital allocation as a planning approval to address the accommodation solutions that would result from the completion of the Orillia Pupil Accommodation Review process. The capital allocation was for \$12.4 million dollars.
7. On October 5 of this year at the required Board meeting for public input we received 3 delegations from the Monsignor Lee Catholic School community with respect to their preference for an alternative site for the proposed MLE / GAN replacement project. The following items were noted as important in the consideration by the Board for the site design of the replacement project, whether it is on an alternative site or the existing MLE site:
 - a. Safety
 - b. Athletics and Recreation
 - c. School Logistics
 - d. School Footprint
8. In response to the recommendations of the Orillia PAC and the input received through the public process, staff has continued to analyse the various requirements to achieve the recommendations. Included in the review and consideration by staff are:
 - a. School Boundaries
 - b. Alternative Site
 - c. Project Design
 - d. Capital Funding

School Boundaries

9. The PAC's recommendations include consideration for review of schools' boundaries to balance enrolments.
10. A Boundary Review for the schools in this area could be initiated based on when the timing of the replacement school projects is known. Proceeding with any review of the School Boundaries would be based on our boundary review process, including consultation with the communities of the affected schools, as well as other projects and priorities of the Board.

Alternative Site Considerations for North Orillia Elementary School

11. In order to respond to the recommendation of the PAC for the alternative site, a planning consultant was engaged by the Board to provide an independent review of alternative sites available in the north Orillia area. We also requested the review of the opportunity for additional property adjacent to the existing Monsignor Lee site by the planning consultant.
12. The engagement with the planning consultant for the site review was based on the following criteria:
 - a. Opportunity to achieve additional property to the existing MLE school site;
 - b. Alternative Sites in the North Ward of the City of Orillia to be within 1.6 Km of the existing Monsignor Lee Elementary School site on Fitton's Road and to be on the east and south sides of Hwy 11;
 - c. Status of the Simcoe County District School Board's Elementary and Secondary School Accommodation Reviews and decisions and potential timing related to future school closures and property disposals;
 - d. Consider the Board's Site Designation Policy as well as the standard components required for an elementary school, as well as any requirements of the municipality and their standards.
13. The final report from the planning consultant considers a number of properties, including the Pupil Accommodation Review and related property dispositions of the Simcoe County District School Board (SCDSB). The report concludes that based on the defined criteria, including time constraints, there are no suitable alternative sites available.
14. Based on no available alternative site for the replacement of the MLE/GAN schools, only Option B can be considered.

15. The report of the planning consultant has also considered the opportunity for additional property adjacent the existing Monsignor Lee site as per the Option B recommendation of the PAC. Staff has initiated discussions with the City of Orillia, as the owner of the Lawn Bowling facility property, adjacent to the existing Monsignor Lee site.
16. If the Lawn Bowling property is available for purchase from the City, there may be an opportunity to enhance the size of the existing Monsignor Lee site and therefore enhance the redevelopment of the Monsignor Lee / Guardian Angels replacement school.

Capital Funding Considerations

17. The Ministry of Education's \$12.4 million dollars in capital funding has been allocated as a *Planning Approval* for the Board's Orillia elementary schools. At this time, it is understood by staff that the financial allocation is a planning approval for a complete Orillia solution, not a partial solution.
18. One of the objectives of the Pupil Accommodation Review is to ensure the school facilities can accommodate the needs of the community including fairness with design and standards between MLE/GAN and SBE.
19. The current estimates for the recommended Capital Projects (replacement MLE/GAN (300-350 pupil places) and replacement SBE (300-350 pupil places)) are \$16-18 million.
20. The *Planning Approval* that was received from the Ministry indicated that additional funding could be available related to the costs for building demolitions and/or costs related to site servicing (storm water, parking lot removal and reinstatement, etc). This funding opportunity is being reviewed with the Ministry; they remain supportive for additional funds for building demolitions and site servicing as provided in the June 11, 2009 correspondence.
21. The current estimates for the new building costs only, are in the range of \$14-16 million. The new building costs estimates are being reviewed for the 2 replacement projects based on:
 - a. The *Planning Approval* received (\$12.4 million);
 - b. Primary Class Size (PCS) capital allocation for the Orillia area (\$1.5 – 2 million))
 - c. Other available funds (Good Places to Learn, Energy Funding, Facility Renewal Projects, Proceeds of Disposition)
22. The Ministry generally supports the use of these additional funds for funding the replacement schools.

23. The overall budget needs for the replacement of these 2 school buildings could be supported based on the combined funding opportunities as noted above.
24. The Ministry of Education has advised there is no money for sites including MLE additional property. Therefore the Board would need to explore funding for this acquisition if the property is available.

Project Design Considerations

St. Bernard's Catholic Elementary School – Replacement Project

25. An architect has been selected for the St. Bernard's replacement project and preliminary site design concepts have been developed. The proposed design is based on a modified repeat design of the new St. Paul's school and was introduced to the Board at the November 11, 2009 Special Board Meeting. The school community will be consulted further on the site design once we are able to move forward with the project.
26. The requirements and options for interim accommodation will need to be reviewed further and may impact project design, project costs and timing considerations.
27. Staff has initiated discussions with the City of Orillia to express interest in the lease of the now vacant David H. Church School on James Street. David H. Church School which was purchased by the City from the Simcoe County District School Board. David H. Church could be used as interim accommodation for the St. Bernard's school during construction.

Monsignor Lee Catholic School/Guardian Angels Catholic School (North Orillia) Replacement School

28. An architect for the proposed North Orillia (Monsignor Lee / Guardian Angels replacement) project was appointed at the October 14, 2009 Board Meeting.
29. The architect was provided with the site issues to be addressed as identified by the PAC and also raised by the delegates at the October 5 meeting.
30. The architect has developed design concepts for the replacement project at the existing Monsignor Lee site and these were shared with the Board on November 11 and then with the Orillia PAC on November 17, 2009.
31. The design concepts address the proposed building, based on either a 2 or 3 storey design, and includes a reconfigured site with a dedicated bus loop and separate parking and kiss'n'ride area as well as a dedicated kindergarten activity area, hard surface activity area and green activity area. The site configuration also considers pedestrian access onto the site from and through the site.

32. The proposed site concepts were shared with the Orillia PAC at the November 17, 2009 meeting of the Orillia PAC. The feedback from the meeting indicated that there continue to be concerns with respect to the size of the existing site and the ability to fit all of the building and supporting components as it is redeveloped. Of particular concern of the existing Monsignor Lee School community is the ability to accommodate a sports field on the redeveloped site. The school community was advised that there will be opportunities to provide input into the site design once the project is approved to proceed.
33. Further consideration will be required on the approach for interim accommodation requirements and how this may impact project design, project costs and timing considerations.
34. In developing plans for this replacement school project, consideration of the history, culture and identity of both Monsignor Lee and Guardian Angels school communities will be taken into consideration.

Summary and Next Steps:

35. The goals and objectives for the Orillia Catholic Elementary School Pupil Accommodation Review (PAR) are to ensure the school facilities can continue to accommodate students effectively while providing equitable programming with a high standard of student learning and in a fiscally responsible manner. This process points to the continued interest in providing better educational facilities for all students in an equitable, open, honest, and fiscally responsible way. The following recommendations provide for accommodation options that will serve the Catholic students and families in the Orillia area for years to come.
36. Based on the above information related to available capital funding, the alternative site and related funding, and the Policy LE-14, staff are presenting the following recommendations. These recommendations are based on the Ministry of Education's Planning Approval and can only be implemented upon the successful completion of the Orillia Catholic Elementary School Pupil Accommodation Review process.
37. Upon approval of the recommendations on the accommodation decisions for the Orillia Area, our policy requires us to provide Notice to the affected school communities. This Notice is to be provided within 1 week of the Board's decision and is to be provided to Parents/Guardians, staff and school Council members and will also be posted on the Board's website.
38. Following the Notice of Decision, there will be a 30 day period from the day of the Board's closure resolution to allow for requests for an administrative review of the Accommodation Review Process. Based on the Board making recommendations this evening the 30 day period would end on January 11, 2009.

39. If no Administrative Review is requested by the school community, then immediately following the 30 day period we can initiate the projects, including working with the school communities on the development of the site and building designs.
40. If an Administrative Review is requested by the school community, then we will need to wait until the completion of the Administrative Review before proceeding with the projects. This would result in delays with the design consultation with the three Orillia (St. Bernard's, Monsignor Lee and Guardian Angels) school communities and delays with the two construction project. There is also the potential that the Ministry planning funding approvals would be in jeopardy.

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. **That the Board approve the status quo for both Foley Catholic School and Notre Dame Catholic School.**
2. **That the Board approve the replacement of St. Bernard's school on the existing site. The replacement school will be designed and constructed to accommodate approximately 350 pupils.**
3. **That the Board approve the consolidation of Guardian Angels and Monsignor Lee in a replacement school on the existing Monsignor Lee site. The new replacement school will be designed and constructed to accommodate approximately 350 pupils. The new replacement school will take into consideration the history and culture of both the Monsignor Lee and Guardian Angels school communities.**
4. **That the Board approve the closure of the existing Guardian Angels school site once the consolidation in the replacement school is complete.**
5. **That the Board approve initiating the boundary reviews in advance of the new schools being open.**
6. **That the Board authorize staff to continue to pursue property for the Monsignor Lee / Guardian Angels replacement school.**